

No: JF/MoSC/04

Dated 29.10.2017.

To

**Shri. Manoj Sinhaji,
Hon Minister of State for Communications,
Govt of India, New Delhi.**

Sub: Request your kind personal intervention on the injustice to about 42,000 officers in BSNL by their demotion to lower pay scales due to wrong presidential order issued by DoT, totally negating the recommendations of BSNL Board by lowering the pay scales of the entry level cadres of JTO and SDE equivalent from the proposed E2 scale to E1 and E3 scale to E2. Kindly approve the standard pay scales of E2 and E3 w.e.f 01.01.2007 (2nd PRC) as recommended by BSNL by replacing the intermediary pay scales of E1A and E2A.

Respected Sir,

Joint Forum of BSNL Executives Associations representing about 47,000 Executives in BSNL, request your personal intervention to address the injustice to the about 42,000 officers working in BSNL throughout the country by their demotion to lower pay scales w.e.f. 01.01.2007.

Sir, about 42,000 Executives, working in JTO and SDE equivalent cadres are directly affected by the Presidential Order issued by DoT on 28.03.2017 and facing demotion to the lower scales of E1 and E2. 15,000 Executives recruited after 01.01.2007 till today, completely demoralized as their basic pay has come down by at least Rs 4200/-. BSNL recommended for the revision of the intermediary pay scales of Rs 9850-250-14600 (E1A) for JTO equivalent cadres and Rs 11875-300-17275 (E2A) for SDE equivalent cadres with standard pay scales of E2 and E3 w.e.f 01.01.2007 as per the conditions stipulated by 2nd PRC. The financial implication on BSNL to implement this proposal is just 46 Crores per annum which BSNL is ready to meet. However DoT approved lower pay scales of E1 and E2, demoting thousands of Executives.

Sir, kindly recall the meeting with your goodself on 03.06.2017 in which it was assured that the Presidential Order issued by DoT on 28.03.2017 will be reviewed and positive action will be taken to approve BSNL proposal. DoT issued the PO, lowering the pay scales from E1A to E1 and E2A to E2, completely ignoring the BSNL proposal to replace the intermediary pay scales of E1A and E2A with standard pay scales of E2 and E3 w.e.f 01.01.2007. Officers in DoT claimed that the Presidential order is as per BSNL proposal dated 09.01.2009. BSNL proposal dated 09.01.2009 was for revised E1A and E2A scales and not for E1 and E2 scales. In fact this BSNL proposal dated 09.01.2009 was rejected twice by DoT on 24.01.2011 and 18.07.2014 and by DPE on 09.07.2014. On rejection of its proposal twice by DoT, BSNL Board on 06.06.2016, proposed revision of the intermediary pay scales of E1A and E2A with standard pay scales of E2 and E3 w.e.f 01.01.2007. E1A and E2A are the only two intermediary pay scales, pending for revision in BSNL w.e.f 01.01.2007. All other pay scales are standard pay scales approved by DoT on 27.02.2009 itself, as per DPE guidelines. The Presidential order issued by DoT on 28.07.2003 clearly states that the pay scales for the BSNL absorbed Executives as well as BSNL direct recruits w.e.f 01.10.2000 are E1A (Rs 9850-250-14600), E2A (Rs 11875-300-17275), E3, E4 and E5. BSNL also recruited new Executives in the pay scales of E1A and E2A since 2001 onwards.

Concerned Officers in DoT suppressed these facts from the then Secretary, DoT and your goodself and proposed lower pay scales of E1 and E2 which resulted demotion of about 42,000 Executives working as JTO, JAO, SDE, AO etc in BSNL. The chart below will explain the resultant situation in BSNL:

Cadre	Pay scale as on 31.12.2006		Pay scale as on 01.01.2007	
JTO equivalent	9850-14600	E1A	8600-14600	E1
SDE equivalent	11875-17275	E2A	10750-16750	E2

Pre-revised scale		Revised scale proposed by BSNL on 06.06.2016		Revised scale approved by DoT on 28.03.2017		Difference in Basic pay itself
E1A	9850-250-14600	E2	20600-46500	E1	16400-40500	Rs 4200
E2A	11875-300-17275	E3	24900-50500	E2	20600-46500	Rs 4300

BSNL proposal is limited to revision of the intermediary pay scales of E1A and E2A with standard pay scales of E2 and E3 which is a residual issue of 2nd PRC. All other pay scales are standard pay scales, already approved by DoT on 27.02.2009 itself. This fact has been repeatedly clarified by BSNL in its letter dated 03.04.2017, 01.05.2017 etc.

BSNL satisfies all the conditions stipulated by 2nd PRC and DPE guidelines. 2nd PRC implementation is based on the Profit Before Tax (PBT) for the year 2007-08 and BSNL recorded Rs 4451 Crores of PBT during 2007-08. Accordingly, 2nd PRC recommendations are fully implemented for all the Executives working as on 31.12.2006, prior to the date of implementation of 2nd PRC. But 2nd PRC equivalent pay scales are not extended to the new recruits after 01.01.2007, rather they had given a lower pay scale.

Sir, even after your personal intervention and categorical assurance on 03.06.2017 that the PO issued by DoT on 28.03.2017 will be reviewed, the matter remains unresolved even after five months. The officers instrumental in lowering the pay scales to E1 and E2 against BSNL proposal is trying to sabotage the proposal for justifying their earlier action. The abnormal delay in settling the issue is demoralizing the young Engineers and other highly talented Executives recruited by BSNL. This will have a serious impact on the growth of BSNL and other prestigious Govt projects undertaken by BSNL like NOFN, LWE, NFS etc.

Sir, your kind personal intervention is once again solicited to approve the BSNL proposal for revision of the intermediary pay scales of E1A and E2A with standard pay scales of E2 and E3 as other standard pay scales are already approved by DoT on 27.02.2009 itself.

With kind regards,

(K. Sebastin)

Convenor, Joint Forum

(Mob: 9868266200, email: sneachq@yahoo.com, ksebastin@gmail.com)

Comparative chart.

<p style="text-align: center;"><u>PO issued by DoT on 28.07.2003</u> <u>(effective from 01.10.2000)</u></p> <p>1. Rs 9850-250-14600 (E1A) scale 2. Rs 11875-300-17275 (E2A) scale (Both E1A and E2A are not standard pay scales) Other standard pay scales: E3, E4, E5 & E6.</p>	<p style="text-align: center;"><u>Stand of DoT</u></p> <p>No such pay scales of E1A and E2A, it is only a fitment formula. Pay scales are only E1 and E2. (In fact E1 and E2 pay scales are not notified by DoT on 28.07.2003)</p>
<p style="text-align: center;"><u>Affordability clause as per DPE Order</u></p> <p>Not more than 20% dip in the Profit Before Tax (PBT) during 2007-08.</p> <p>PBT for BSNL during 2007-08 is Rs 4451 Crores. The total expenditure is less than 10% of PBT.</p>	<p style="text-align: center;"><u>Stand of DoT</u></p> <p>BSNL is making huge losses during 2013-14, 2014-15 and 2015-16. (In fact these years performance has to be considered for 3rd PRC, not 2nd PRC)</p>
<p style="text-align: center;"><u>BSNL proposal</u></p> <p>Replacement of non standard pay scales of E1A and E2A with E2 and E3 w.e.f 01.01.2007. Other standard pay scales will remain as it is. It is a residual item of 2nd PRC.</p>	<p style="text-align: center;"><u>Stand of DoT</u></p> <p>To be considered by 3rd PRC. BSNL may demand upgradation of remaining scales also. (BSNL categorically told DoT to approve E2 and E3 pay scales alone)</p>
<p style="text-align: center;"><u>BSNL proposal of 09.01.2009</u></p> <p>Revised non standard pay scales of E1A and E2A.</p>	<p style="text-align: center;"><u>Stand of DoT</u></p> <p>BSNL proposal rejected initially on 24.01.2011 and finally on 18.07.2014.</p>
<p style="text-align: center;"><u>BSNL proposal of 09.01.2009</u></p> <p>Revised non standard pay scales of E1A and E2A.</p>	<p style="text-align: center;"><u>Stand of DoT on 27.03.2017</u></p> <p>BSNL proposal is E1 and E2. (In fact there is no proposal of E1 and E2 from BSNL. DoT mis-interpreted it)</p>
<p style="text-align: center;"><u>Status on non standard pay scales in BSNL</u></p> <p>Revised non standard pay scales of E1A and E2A to lower pay scales of E1 and E2.</p>	<p style="text-align: center;"><u>Status of non standard pay scales in other CPSUs</u></p> <p>All pay scales upgraded to next higher scales.</p>
<p style="text-align: center;"><u>Financial implications</u></p> <p>Rs 46 Crores per year.</p>	<p style="text-align: center;"><u>Stand of DoT</u></p> <p>Huge financial implications.</p>
<p style="text-align: center;"><u>Financial implications</u></p> <p>Rs 46 Crores per year.</p>	<p style="text-align: center;"><u>Stand of DoT</u></p> <p>Huge financial implications.</p>